

Utilizing Volunteers in Emergency Response

Addressing Liability and Managing the Risk in West Virginia June 2012

Claire Lee Reiss, J.D., ARM, CPCU
National League of Cities Risk Information Sharing Consortium

creiss@nlcmutual.com

Who are Emergency "Volunteers"?

- Individuals (not always unpaid)
 - Nonprofit organizations
 - Businesses
 - Organized volunteer teams





What Functions do Emergency "Volunteers" Perform?



What are the Concerns?

The volunteer may cause harm

Bodily injury

Property damage

Vehicle accidents

Personal Injury

Intentional or wrongful acts

Professional errors/omissions

The law may limit the volunteer's activities

Licenses

Permits

Certificates

The volunteer may be harmed

Injury

Death

Discrimination

Illness

Property damage



What are the Concerns?

Direct consequences

- Damage awards
- Settlements
- Costs of legal defense
- Loss of property
- Loss of personnel

May be some protection

Indirect consequences

- Damage to reputation
- Loss of support & funding
- Loss of partnerships
- Diminished volunteer base
- Higher insurance premiums

No protection

Chilling effect of all the above

To Whom Does Liability Matter?

Governmental agencies

Organizers of volunteer programs

Business and nonprofit organizations

Employers of volunteers

Individual volunteers

Supervisors and trainers of volunteers

Donors of premises, equipment & supplies

Types of Liability Protection

Workers' Compensation

A system of statutory benefits for workers who are injured during covered employment

Immunity

Exemption from civil liability in described circumstances

Indemnity

Assumption of financial responsibility for liability of someone else

License, Certificate & Permit Recognition

Special recognition of emergency workers' professional and trade credentials

What to Look for in a Statute

Who is covered?

Are there prerequisites for coverage?

Are there any important defined terms?

Are there any exclusions?

What does the statute do for those covered?

Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: mandatory v. optional

Issue 2: Identify the employer

Issue 3: Average weekly wage

Issue 4: Other available injury compensation

What Liability Protection is Available? Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: Mandatory v. optional

Answer:

Must be determined on case by case basis

- Type of organization and function is important
- Statutory and regulatory language sometimes unclear

Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: Mandatory v. optional

Coverage mandatory:

- •Members of mine rescue teams assisting in mine accidents with the consent of the owner who, in such case, shall be deemed the employer, or at the direction of the department of mines. §23-2-1a(a)(4)
- •All forest firefighters assisting in the prevention, confinement and suppression of any forest fire under the supervision of the director of the department of natural resources or a designated representative. §23-2-1a(a)(5)



What Liability Protection is Available? Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: Mandatory v. optional

Coverage Optional:

- •Volunteer rescue squads, police auxiliaries, and EMS organizations created/ sponsored by government entities. §23-2-1(b)(7) & 85 CSR 8-4
- •Nonprofit and volunteer organizations. 85 CSR 8-8-3
- •Churches. §23-2-1(b)(5) & 85 CSR 8-4.3d (Churches are exempt from mandatory workers' compensation)

Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: mandatory v. optional

Benefit of providing coverage when it is optional:

- Reduces upside exposure exclusive remedy
- Exemption of employer from tort liability for injuries to covered volunteers.
 §23-2-6
- Exemption of fellow employees from tort liability for injuries and if does not inflict an injury with deliberate intention.
 - §23-2-6A
 - SB 458 & HB 4479

Prerequisite - If coverage is optional, employer must give notice of the coverage to the covered workers and if they remain employed, they are considered to have waived common law damages.

Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: mandatory v. optional

Challenges:

- Will anyone sell you coverage?
- Where will you get the money to pay for it?
- Will anyone work with you if you don't have it?

Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: Mandatory v. optional?

Coverage required for volunteers as "employees"

Government entities, including the state and political subdivisions, **volunteer fire departments or companies, and emergency service organizations** as defined in the Homeland Security and Emergency Management Act (HSEMA) must cover **"employees"**.

HSEMA organizations are:

- Local emergency service organizations
- Regional emergency service organizations
- Mobile support units

§23-2-1(a), §15-5-1 et seq.



Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: Mandatory v. optional?

Gray areas §23-2-1(a), §15-5-1 et seq.

- Non-operational volunteers for volunteer fire departments
- "Emergency services organizations" not defined
- Whose workers' compensation coverage?



What Liability Protection is Available? Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 1: Coverage: Mandatory v. optional?

Protect your volunteers

- •Do not assume that an organization that you believe is required to provide workers' compensation coverage actually does so ask for evidence
- •If there is workers' compensation coverage, be sure that volunteers are covered, not just paid employees
- •Do not assume your particular organization is (or is not) required to provide workers 'compensation coverage consult with an experienced attorney

Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 2: Identify the employer

Is the regular employer responsible for workers' compensation for emergency volunteers?

- •<u>Yes</u>, if the volunteer's emergency services activities are part of the volunteer's job and he or she is being paid by the regular employer during those activities.
- •No, if the volunteer's emergency services activities are a personal activity unrelated to employment responsibilities.

If both the regular employer and the emergency services organization are involved and have workers' compensation coverage, responsibility may have to be negotiated or litigated.

Consider: An organization lending its employees should consider a written agreement with the emergency services organization that transfers control of and responsibility for the employees during activation.

Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 3: Average weekly wage

- •Workers' compensation benefits for covered, unpaid volunteers are based on the volunteer's earnings "wherever earned" i.e. at his or her regular job. §23-4-14(a)
- •Benefits are subject to statutory maximums and minimums based on the state average weekly wage. §23-4-6

Workers' Compensation Act

Injury to Volunteers

Issue 4: What other injury compensation might be available for injured emergency services volunteers?

- Accidental injury, accident and sickness, or accidental death and dismemberment insurance
- Health and disability insurance
- Motor vehicle insurance (vehicle owner or adverse party)
- Personal injury claim or lawsuit
 - Third parties
 - In most situations, not against an employer that provides workers' compensation, or its officers, managers, agents, representative or employees

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Immunity

Immunity is never absolute

All immunity statutes limit the scope of immunity to ensure that persons with bad intent are not protected. Examples of excluded behavior include:

- Willful and wanton misconduct
- Bad faith (or not in good faith)
- Gross negligence
- Intentional disregard for the safety of others
- •Immunity only for "negligence"
- Recklessness
- Malicious purpose
- Intentional misconduct

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Immunity

Immunity for emergency services workers

Duly qualified emergency service workers are not liable for injury, death or property damage resulting from their activities in compliance or in a reasonable attempt to comply with the Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act (HSEMA), in the absence of willful misconduct.

The state, its political subdivisions and their agencies are also immune.

§15-5-11(a)

This section also provides that license requirements for any professional, mechanical or other skills do not apply to an authorized emergency service worker practicing those skills in an emergency.

§15-5-11(b)

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Who is a "duly qualified emergency service worker"?

- Duly qualified full or part time paid, volunteer or auxiliary employee of this state, or any other state, territory, possession or the District of Columbia, of the federal government, of any neighboring country or political subdivision thereof, or of any agency or organization performing emergency services in this state subject to the order or control of or pursuant to the request of the state or any political subdivision.
- **Duly qualified instructors and properly supervised students** in recognized educational programs where emergency services are taught.
- A member of any duly qualified mine rescue team designated by a mine operator under the Code and who is performing emergency rescue services.

§15-5-11(c)

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

What are "emergency services"?

Preparation for and carrying out of all emergency functions to protect, respond and recover, to prevent, detect, deter and mitigate, to minimize and repair injury and damage resulting from disasters. Emergency functions include:

- •Fire fighting, police
- Medical and health, emergency welfare, housing, community facilities
- Communications, evacuation, emergency transportation
- Restoration of utilities
- Special weapons defense (chemical, radiological and other)
- Activities necessary or incidental to preparation or carrying out of above

§15-5-2(a)

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

What are "disasters"?

What is "disaster recovery"?

What is a "political subdivision"?

- A disaster is the occurrence or imminent threat of widespread or severe damage, injury or loss of life or property resulting from any natural or terrorist or man-made cause... §15-5-2(h)
- **Disaster recovery** includes activities **before**, **during or after a disaster** to provide, or to participate in the provision of **emergency services**, temporary housing, residential housing, essential business activities and community facilities. §15-5-2(i)
- A political subdivision is any county or municipal corporation in West Virginia §15-5-2(d)

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Requirements for association with a homeland security or emergency service organization

- Must not:
 - have been convicted of a felony
 - > advocate now or in the past government overthrow by violence
 - > be currently charged or convicted of a subversive act against the U.S.
- Must:
 - undergo a background check.
 - > take a written loyalty oath as set forth in the statute

§15-5-15

Question: Do these requirements factor into "duly qualified emergency services worker"?

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Intrastate Mutual aid

Statewide mutual aid system

- License, certificate and permit recognition
- For the purposes of liability, all persons responding under the operational control of the requesting political subdivision are deemed to be employees of the requesting participating political subdivision
- Personnel of a political subdivision who are injured or killed while rendering assistance and in the scope and course of their employment are entitled to:
 - Benefits normally available while working for employer
 - > Additional state and federal benefits available for line of duty deaths

§15-5-28(i), (I) and (m)

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Interstate and Intrastate Mutual aid

Mobile Support Units. Units created and deployed by the Governor within or outside West Virginia to reinforce emergency service organizations in stricken areas. Personnel who are not employed by the state or a political subdivision have the **same rights and immunities as state employees**. §15-5-7

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Interstate Mutual aid

Duly qualified emergency service workers. When performing duties in West Virginia pursuant to a lawful agreement, compact or arrangement for mutual aid and assistance to which West Virginia or a political subdivision is a party, have the **same power, duties, immunities and privileges they would have in their own state, province or political subdivision**. §15-5-11(d)



Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Interstate Mutual aid - Emergency Management Assistance Compact Articles V & VI

- Provides immunity for an assisting state and that state's officers or employees when they are aiding a requesting state
- Protects only acts that are in good faith, and excludes willful misconduct, gross negligence, or recklessness
- Recognizes licenses, certificates or permits issued by the responding state for professional, mechanical or other skills requested by the state receiving aid (subject to Governor's limitations)

§15-5-22

Note: The Mobile Support Units statute, W. Va. Code §15-5-7, provides a basis for recognizing members of these units as **state employees** when deployed

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Homeland Security & Emergency Management Act

Donors of premises for shelter

- "Persons" who own or control real estate or other premises ("Person" includes corporations, volunteer organizations and other entities see §15-5-2(k))...
- Who **voluntarily and without compensation** permit the designation or use of all or part of the real estate or premises...
- To shelter persons during an actual, impending, mock or practice emergency...
- Are not civilly liable for negligently causing death or injury to any sheltered person on or about the real estate or damage to their property

§15-5-12

Question: What about injuries to shelter workers?

What Liability Protection is Available? Good Samaritan/Tort laws

Good Samaritan/Tort Laws

Aid to victims of accident and crime

Limited immunity from liability for civil damages for good faith acts and omissions of persons who render **emergency care** to a **victim** at the **scene of an accident or crime**

- •Immunity for **individuals**, including those licensed to practice medicine or dentistry...
- Immunity applies to emergency care
- Care must be provided at the scene of an accident or crime

§55-7-15

Question: What about illnesses and medical emergencies not related to accident or crime?

Good Samaritan/Tort laws

Public Health Law

Automated external defibrillator (AED)

Limited immunity from liability for civil damages for acts and omissions of persons in rendering emergency medical care or treatment involving the use of an AED

- •For "anticipated operator" (someone trained per the statute who utilizes an AED that is part of an early defibrillation program), immunity conditioned on the AED program being in compliance with the statute and the anticipated user gratuitously and in good faith rendering emergency care using the AED other than in the course of the operator's employment or profession as a health care provider
- •For "unanticipated operator", immunity conditioned on gratuitously and in good faith rendering emergency care using the AED
- No gross negligence

§16-4D-4

What Liability Protection is Available? Good Samaritan/Tort laws

Good Samaritan/Tort Laws

Ski patrol rendering emergency care

Limited immunity from civil damages for good faith acts and omissions when providing **emergency aid or care** to an injured or ill person during patrol, **at the scene** of a rescue operation or **while transporting** for transfer to an emergency medical center or hospital

•Must be a member in good standing of a national ski patrol system (a national organization whose members are uncompensated - excluding facility access, amenities, gifts and discounts - and required to train in safety and emergency medical treatment)

§55-7-16

Good Samaritan/Tort laws

Good Samaritan/Tort Laws

Immunity from liability for trained hazardous substance response personnel

Limited immunity from civil damages for good faith acts and omissions in the course of rendering advice or assistance without remuneration at the scene of an actual or threatened discharge of a hazardous substance

- Must be trained in a qualified program of hazardous substance emergency response certified by the state fire marshal
- •Limited immunity protects a qualified person who receives reimbursement for out of pocket costs or compensation from regular employer while providing advice or assistance
- "Hazardous substances" defined in statutes/regulations

§55-7-17

What Liability Protection is Available? Good Samaritan/Tort laws

Good Samaritan/Tort laws

Good Samaritan Food Donation Act

Persons or corporations who donate food or grocery products

Immunity for a "person" (includes a wide variety of organizations and entities), "gleaner", and nonprofit organization from **civil or criminal liability** for death or injury due to the nature, age, packaging or condition of **apparently wholesome food or apparently fit groceries** donated/received in good faith for free distribution to the needy. Excludes gross negligence and intentional misconduct. §55-7D-1 through 5 - §55-7D-3

Landowners or occupiers who allow collection or gleaning of donations

Protects landowners or occupiers from **civil or criminal liability** for injury or death to a gleaner or representative of a nonprofit while collecting or gleaning food on the landowner's property. Excludes gross negligence and intentional misconduct.

§55-7D-4

Governmental Tort Claims Act

Governmental Tort Claims and Insurance Reform Act

Immunity from liability for employees of political subdivisions

An **employee of a political subdivision** is immune from liability unless one of the following applies:

- •Acts or omissions were manifestly outside the scope of employment or official responsibilities, or
- •Acts or omissions were with malicious purpose, in bad faith or in a wanton or reckless manner, or
- Liability is expressly imposed by the West Virginia Code

§29-12A-5

Immunity does not apply to contractual liability, employment practices and labor relations, violations of the constitution or statutes of the United States.

§29-12A-18

Governmental Tort Claims Act

Governmental Tort Claims and Insurance Reform Act

Who is an "employee of a political subdivision"?

Employees include employees or servants, **whether compensated or not**, whether full-time or not, who are **authorized and acting within the scope** of employment for the political subdivision.

Political subdivisions include **volunteer fire departments and emergency service organizations** as recognized by an appropriate political body and authorized by law to perform a governmental function. (see §15-5-11 – emergency service activities are governmental functions.)

Thus, unpaid employees (volunteers) of recognized and authorized volunteer fire departments and emergency service organizations have immunity.

§29-12A-3

Governmental Tort Claims Act

Governmental Tort Claims and Insurance Reform Act

What responsibility does the political subdivision have for the volunteers?

The **political subdivision can be liable as an organization** for its volunteer's acts or omissions, even if the volunteer is immune.

§29-12A-4 & 5

The political subdivision is responsible to:

- •**Defend** a volunteer who acted in good faith and "not manifestly outside" the scope of employment/responsibility.
- •Indemnify and hold harmless a volunteer from any judgment arising from an act in good faith and within the scope of employment/official responsibility.

§29-12A-11

Volunteer Protection Laws

Volunteer Protection Laws

Limited civil liability of qualified directors

Limited immunity from civil liability for negligent acts and omissions by qualified directors performing managerial functions without compensation for a volunteer organization

- Excludes gross negligence and operation of motor vehicles
- •Volunteer organization or entity not immune for negligent acts of director

§55-7C-3

Volunteer Protection Laws

Volunteer Protection Laws

Limited civil liability of qualified directors

Managerial functions are governing and controlling the organization, excluding physical or manual handling or use of tangible property, and the direct guidance or supervision of persons.

Qualified directors serve without compensation (other than expense reimbursement) as an officer, member or director of a volunteer organization or entity.

Volunteer organization or entity includes the state, political subdivisions and nonprofit organizations that have one of the purposes listed in W. VA. Code

§55-7C-2

Volunteer Protection Laws

Volunteer Protection Laws

Federal Volunteer Protection Act of 1997

Limited immunity for **individuals** who work as **uncompensated** volunteers for **government agencies and nonprofit organizations**

- Volunteers must be registered with such an organization and acting within the scope of their responsibilities
- Protects only individual volunteers, not their organizations
- Volunteers must be properly licensed, certified, or authorized by the appropriate authorities for the activities in the state where the harm occurred
- Excludes liability arising from willful or criminal misconduct, gross negligence, reckless misconduct, or a conscious, flagrant indifference to the rights or safety of the individual harmed by the volunteer
- Excludes harm caused by **operation of a vehicle** for which the law requires that the operator be licensed or have insurance the law requires

Other Possible Liability Protection

- Homeowner's, renter's, and personal umbrella insurance
- Commercial, general or public entity liability insurance
- Public entity self-insured plan
- Professional liability insurance
- Automobile liability insurance
- Liability insurance for directors and officers or public officials
- Agreements

Components of Risk Management

Risk identification & assessment

What can go wrong and the likely consequences

Risk "control"/mitigation

Reduce losses and their consequences

Comply with the law

Enhance the program's ability to fulfill its mission

Risk financing

Pay for losses that occur

Risk Financing - Nothing Provides 100% Protection

Statutes

Insurance

Agreements with others

NO GUARANTEES!

Risk Identification & Assessment

Identify possible liability events

Assess the likelihood and consequences

Establish priorities



Risk "Control"/Mitigation

Screening and selecting volunteers & affiliates

Preparing volunteers for their roles, i.e. training, safety

Managing volunteers, i.e. supervising



Conclusion

What you can do now to address liability

Talk to leaders of your organization and sponsoring agency: know what is actually being done

Find a legal advisor

Manage the program's risk

Give volunteers an accurate picture